Description	Rev. Est. Savings '£,000 Reflecting part year	Impact narrative	Impact	Decision at Previous Scrutiny or New Proposal	APPENDIX 5 Further Detail on Savings Options
	£000				
ENVIRONMENT					
REGENERATION, PLANNING & EC	CONOMIC				
General - Savings that have no direct impact on service users	530				
Removal of Bargoed ice rink from December 2015.	20	Reduced events availability to local residents that visit the ice rink.	Low	Not Supported - Additional Information Required & Further Consultation	The Ice Rink was initially funded in 2010 by an external grant (HOV) but is now largely funded by the Council, admission fees and a contribution from Bargoed Town Council. The net cost to the Council in 2013/2014 was circa £26,000. Bargoed Town Council have asked that the cost of staging the event is reviewed following the 2014 event, which has reduced from nine days to five days, so that the Town Council can assess their funding commitment to the event in light of the budgetary pressures under consideration. Officers have reviewed the town centre footfall figures for additionality during the period of the 2013 Ice Rink. The 2013 Ice Rink was held over a nine day period that included two consecutive weekends and comparison of the recorded footfall figures with average footfall for the time of year indicate that the significant increase in additional footfall recorded during the first day of the ice rink was driven by the staging of the Bargoed Christmas market. This is supported by a review of the footfall data for the 2012 event and indicates that the presence of the ice rink is not driving footfall through the town centre. In addition there is a cost associated with the ice rink relating to the loss of car park income of circa £1,500. Members should note that the other events in Bargoed during the summer and Christmas period would not be affected by this saving option, this option only relates to the Ice Rink due to the relatively high cost relative to the potential economic benefits. Appendix 2 provides a break down of the total costs and funding of the Events programme in 2013/2014 including details of Council and external funding for each event.

Description	Rev. Est. Savings '£,000 Reflecting part year	Impact narrative	Impact	Decision at Previous Scrutiny or New Proposal	APPENDIX 5 Further Detail on Savings Options
Community Regeneration - Area Forum Budget removal. Utilise reserves of £162k over next few years	72	Minimal impact as these schemes are additional to core maintenance provision. In addition some wards/partnership areas do not spend the allocation hence the £162,000 reserve. Impact would be	Low	Not Supported - Additional Information Required	The Area Forum budget is held by Community Regeneration for small environmental schemes identified by the Community Partnerships. Where these are not in place the respective ward members identify spend. Some of the schemes such as benches, litter bins etc are delivered by internal departments. The budget has also been used however for larger schemes and used for match funding of facilities such as play parks, skate parks and larger environmental schemes.
TOTAL REGENERATION, PLANNIN	622				

Description	Rev. Est. Savings '£,000 Reflecting part year	Impact narrative	Impact	Decision at Previous Scrutiny or New Proposal	APPENDIX 5 Further Detail on Savings Options
ENGINEERING DIVISION	£000				
General savings that have no	179				
Highways Operations - Street Lighting energy reduction option - use of new technologies/part management lighting. Full year saving £450k	100	A combination of options will generate £450k saving in full year. This may require some part lighting in residential areas. This will require up front investment of £700k + £200k. This contributes to Councils carbon reduction targets. Consultation may not be required if the new technologies being reviewed can achieve the savings required. The use of new technologies will reduce the need/amount of part lighting required. No effect on jobs.	Medium	Not Supported - Additional Information Required on Energy saving technologies for further consideration	consultation (if part night lighting necessary) / procurement / implementation will mean a lengthy lead in period. It should be noted that this is new emerging technology that is only
Highways Operations - Reduction in planned carriageway resurfacing budget (20% of budget).		Reduction in revenue budget will defer investment in Councils largest asset for future years. No consultation required, possible reduction in workforce, depends on capital budget support.	Medium	Not Supported - Additional Information Required	Scrutiny requested additional information in relation to the longer term impacts if this saving proposal was to be supported. Previous options ranged from 16% to 48%. The detailed impacts of a £300,000 (20%) saving are now confirmed in the updated Implication <b>Note Appendix 4 ESD IN (ii)</b> Detailed deterioration graphs are appended to this.

Description	Rev. Est. Savings '£,000 Reflecting part year	Impact narrative	Impact	Decision at Previous Scrutiny or New Proposal	APPENDIX 5 Further Detail on Savings Options
Highways Operations - Reduction in planned footway resurfacing budget (12% of budget).	60	Reduction in revenue budget will defer investment in Councils largest asset for future years. No consultation required, possible reduction in workforce, depends on capital budget support.	Medium	Not Supported - Additional Information Required	Scrutiny requested additional information in relation to the longer term impacts if this saving proposal was to be supported. Previous options ranged from 20% to 50%. The detailed impacts of a £60,000 (12% - new proposal) saving are now confirmed in the updated Implication <b>Note Appendix 4 ESD IN (iii)</b> . Detailed deterioration graphs are appended to this.
Highways Operations - Gully Reed Bed recycling. increase income by promoting facility to other authorities and private sector	10	Additional promotion with adjoining authorities to increase use of facility needed. Relies on winning new customers. No formal consultation required. No effect on jobs.	Low	Supported	Previously supported by Scrutiny. Promotional literature and some marketing will be required.
Highways Operations - Reduce highways reactive maintenance budget by 4%.	50	Budget will need close monitoring to ensure reduction in planned maintenance does not significantly increase reactive maintenance which could also increase third party claims. No consultation required. This will result in 1 no loss of job within NCS which will be achieved through vacancy management.	Medium	Not Supported - Additional Information Required	Scrutiny requested additional information in relation to the longer term impacts if this saving proposal was to be supported. Previous options ranged from 4% to 8%. The detailed impacts of a £50,000 (4%) saving are now confirmed in the updated Implication Note <b>Appendix 4 ESD IN (iv).</b>

Description	Rev. Est. Savings '£,000 Reflecting part year	Impact narrative	Impact	Decision at Previous Scrutiny or New Proposal	APPENDIX 5 Further Detail on Savings Options
Highways Operations - Reduce highway/land drainage planned maintenance budget by 11%	30	Reduction will slow investment in infrastructure that deals with climate change. No formal consultation required. This will contribute to an aggregated reduction in jobs within NCS (o.6 fte). This will be achieved through vacancy management	Medium	Not Supported	This proposal was not supported by Scrutiny. Only the highest risk categorisation works will be undertaken.
Highways Operations - Reduce gritting routes from 9 to 8	60	Route optimisation being undertaken to provide an option to reduce routes from 9 to 8 but still keep existing coverage. No consultation required. No effect on jobs.	Low	Not Supported - Additional Information Required	This is an amended option. The investment in route optimisation software allows officers to review existing gritting routes. Early indications are that the existing routes can be reduced from 9 to 8 without any significant change in the duration to undertake gritting on the existing defined network. This information has been updated in the Implication Note Appendix 4 ESD IN (v).
Highways Operations - Reduce aids to movement budget by 25% (road markings/signs/crossing points).		Small reduction in current work levels. Minimal risk. No consultation required. No direct effect on jobs. However will add to an aggregated reduction in overall budgets which will result in job reductions (0.5fte). This will be achieved through vacancy management.	Low	Supported	This option was previously supported by Scrutiny with a 10% saving. Following further review it is considered by officers that this could be increased to £25k (25%) without significant detrimental impact on the service provided.

Description	Rev. Est. Savings '£,000 Reflecting part year	Impact narrative	Impact	Decision at Previous Scrutiny or New Proposal	APPENDIX 5 Further Detail on Savings Options
Highways Operations - Reduction in highways/land drainage reactive maintenance budget by 4%.	20	Difficult to assess impact as budget is weather susceptible. No consultation required. This will contribute to an aggregated reduction in job within NCS (0.4 fte). This will be achieved through vacancy management.	Medium	Not Supported	This proposal was not supported by Scrutiny. It should be noted that this budget line is weather susceptible given its reactive nature.
Highways Operations - Reduction in structures and retaining walls budget by 10%.	50	Only the highest priority work is currently being undertaken. This will need to continue and some key priorities may need to be delayed. No consultation required. This will contribute to an aggregated reduction in jobs within NCS (0.5 fte). This will be achieved through vacancy management.	Medium	Not Supported - Additional Information Required	Scrutiny requested additional information in relation to the longer term impacts if this saving proposal was to be supported. Previous options ranged from 10% to 20%. The detailed impacts of a £50,000 (10%) saving are now confirmed in the updated Implication <b>Note Appendix 4 ESD IN (vi).</b>

Description	Rev. Est. Savings '£,000 Reflecting part year	Impact narrative	Impact	Decision at Previous Scrutiny or New Proposal	APPENDIX 5 Further Detail on Savings Options
Highways Operations - Remove financial support for Christmas lighting in towns and villages.	35	Historic anomalies of funding to various bodies. No formal consultation required. No risk in removing budget. Community Councils/Town Councils will need to arrange their own funding.	Low	Supported - Requested list of affected areas	This proposal was supported by Scrutiny. A full list of locations that will be effected has been circulated to Scrutiny members.
Highways Operations - Highways adoption and agreement fees. Increase in fees	15	Raise fees in line with neighbouring Councils. No public consultation required. No effect on jobs.	Low	Supported	Scrutiny previously supported this option but asked for comparison data with other LA's.  Refer to revised Implication <b>Note Appendix 4 ESD IN (vii).</b>
Transport Engineering - Cease holding events in pay & display car park sites. Events leads to loss of car park income		Either events cover loss of income, are held in other locations or are not held. No public consultation required. No negative effect on jobs.	Low	Supported - but further liaison with Planning and Regeneration division	Scrutiny previously supported this option. Further liaison with Planning officers has taken place. Offset costs due to event increasing car parking demand elsewhere will factor in whether the annual £20k will need to be achieved to realise loss of income.
Transport Engineering - Car park tariffs. Increase car parking charges by typically 10p per hour	30	Similar actions are being considered by other Councils. Formal notification procedure required. No negative impact on jobs. No public consultation required.	Low	Not Supported - Additional Information Required	This option is consistent for all pay and display car parks. Scrutiny previously requested a County wide review of the disparity across the borough. Given the implications for consultation and legal processes, this would need to be commenced for 2016/17 financial year.

Description	Rev. Est. Savings '£,000 Reflecting part year	Impact narrative	Impact	Decision at Previous Scrutiny or New Proposal	APPENDIX 5 Further Detail on Savings Options
Transport Engineering - Management of off street car parks - increase Excess Charge Notice (ECN) penalty	25	No impact on service. Formal notification procedure required. No negative impact on jobs. No public consultation required.	Low	Supported	Scrutiny previously supported the option. This will increase the ECN early payment from £30 to £40.
Transport Engineering - Management of off street car parks - introduce Sunday charges	10	No impact on service. No effect on jobs. Public consultation required.	Low	Not Supported - Additional Information Required	This was intended to be considered as part of the County wide review requested by Scrutiny but has now been brought forward as an individual option. Refer to attached Implication Note Appendix 4 ESD IN (viii).
Passenger Transport - Concessionary pass replacements. Increase charges - currently £5 for second and subsequent - revise to £5 for first and £10 for subsequent replacements		No impact on service. No consultation required. No effect on jobs.	Low	Supported	Scrutiny previously supported this option.
Passenger Transport - Review of passenger transport services - Full Year impact £150k	24	No effect on jobs. Public consultation required.	Medium	Not Supported - Additional Information Required	The description is different to the original scrutiny proposal. The original option was a specific and direct cut, which was part of the overall package of such options. However, to achieve the saving figures within the report, officers can work on a number of items to achieve the savings targets without undertaking such a direct approach. Refer to new Implication Note Appendix 4 ESD IN (ix).
TOTAL ENGINEERING DIVISION	1,050				

Description	Rev. Est. Savings '£,000 Reflecting part year	Impact narrative	Impact	Decision at Previous Scrutiny or New Proposal	APPENDIX 5 Further Detail on Savings Options
PUBLIC PROTECTION	£000				
General - Savings that have no direct impact on service users	22				
Licensing - Income - Increase fees.	8	Fees will be increased to recover costs associated as appropriate. This will result in increased cost to the service user and may lead to a fall in take up of the service.	Low	Supported	
Registrars - Income - Increase fees.	10	Fees will be increased to recover costs associated as appropriate. This will result in increased cost to the service user and may lead to a fall in take up of the service.	Low	Supported	

Description	Rev. Est. Savings '£,000 Reflecting part year	Impact narrative	Impact	Decision at Previous Scrutiny or New Proposal	APPENDIX 5 Further Detail on Savings Options
Health Imp. Officer - 1 vacant post (0. 6 FTE) & Senior Health Improvement Officer SEHO 1 vacant post (1FTE).	77	The Health Improvement Team strategically leads and delivers the local response to Health Challenge Wales and Change 4 Life Interventions as well as contribution to our Corporate Health activities. The Team consists of 5.4 FTE with 1.8 FTE delivering the Healthy Schools Programme and funded by grant. Deleting 1.6 FTE will significantly impact upon the capacity of team, as 1 post is the Senior Officer that leads the	Medium	Not Supported - Additional Information Required	The option presented to the Special Scrutiny meeting of 4/9/14 was to delete the 3.6 FTE posts in the Health Improvement Team. Since the Report to the Special Scrutiny the 0.6 fte post and Senior Health Improvement Officer post have become vacant. Therefore the revised option is to delete the 1.6 posts with 2 fte posts remaining. Committee Members were advised during the meeting that the Health Improvement Team lead and deliver corporate employee health and wellbeing programmes including health screening for staff. They have identified and helped staff to correct numerous health problems, including one employee that was suffering from an immediate potentially life-threatening health condition. Members were informed that in addition to improving lifestyles and engaging with communities, the Team were also tackling the issue of lower life expectancy in certain areas of the county borough. Members asked for more information to demonstrate the impact of the work of the Team on local health issues and challenges (such as smoking cessation rates) and a 29 page briefing document was sent to all Members on 2/10/2014.
Environmental Health Officer - 1 vacant post (1 FTE)		Reducing the 3 EHOs within the General Environmental Health Team to 2 will extend the time taken to deal with and investigate service requests.	Medium		The General Environmental Health Team protects public health and quality of life by dealing with complaints of nuisances or hazards of health e.g. noise, defective drains and sewers, investigation of odours, bonfires etc. They deal with filthy and verminous premises and travellers sites, and are also involved in problems of pest infestations, straying animals and irresponsible dog ownership. They also enforce in relation to littering, dog fouling and fly tipping activities. The team responds to approximately 15,000 requests for service per year. Much of the work undertaken by this team contributes to the Healthier and Greener priorities within the Single Plan, "Caerphilly Delivers". They assist in the provision of better health and healthier lifestyles within our communities.
TOTAL PUBLIC PROTECTION	162				

Description	Rev. Est. Savings '£,000 Reflecting part year	Impact narrative	Impact	Decision at Previous Scrutiny or New Proposal	APPENDIX 5 Further Detail on Savings Options
COMMUNITY & LEISURE SERVICE	£000				
General - Savings that have no direct impact on service users	338				
Parks & Playing Fields - Cessation of summer "Bands in the Park" events programme	2	Little or no impact on appearance of County Borough but there may be some complaints from the limited audience that typically enjoy these vents.	Low	New Proposal	
Parks and Playing Fields - 2nd phase of the removal of flower beds in parks & open spaces.		Phase 1 complete in 2014/2015 without any real issues.	Low	Supported	
Parks and Playing Fields - Reduction in playing field maintenance. Remove 2 fertilizer applications & cease end of season renovation works	30	Officers have considered an alternative option involving cessation of regular pitch marking and handing over pitch marking responsibility to clubs (subject to consultation). The saving would be the same but some pitch renovation could then be undertaken.	Medium	Not Supported - Additional Information Required & Further Consultation	As stated, officers have considered an alternative (reducing pitch marking). This will, however, need to be the subject of consultation with Sports Clubs.

Description	Rev. Est. Savings '£,000 Reflecting part year	Impact narrative	Impact	Decision at Previous Scrutiny or New Proposal	APPENDIX 5 Further Detail on Savings Options
Parks and Playing Fields - Increase outdoor facility charges by 20%.	20	To reduce the impact on junior sport, the Scrutiny members suggested that Officers examine options to only increase adult fees while keeping junior fees at current levels. If this strategy is employed there are a range of options available which are outlined in column J		Not Supported - Alternative option to be considered	If the service did not increase junior fees but increased adult fees, the following savings options are possible:-  • Increase of 40% in adult fees = additional £27k income  • Increase of 45% in adult fees = additional £31k income  • Increase of 50% in adult fees = additional £34k income  • Increase of 100% in adult fees = additional £69k income
Parks and Playing Fields - Review park ranger service to reduce from 18 to 12.	40	Can be accommodated by not engaging agency staff issues still in the Spring of 2015.	Medium	Supported	
Parks and Playing Fields - Cessation of litter picking at 14 parks on Saturdays	12	May result in increased littering (particularly in spring/summer). Potential for increase in public complaints.	Medium	New Proposal	The Parks affected would be:-  Newbridge Park  Oakdale Recreation Ground  Ty Isaf Welfare  Waunfawr Park  Risca Town centre  Rhymney Park  Bargoed Park  Gilfach Welfare  Penyrheol Park  Abertridwr Park  Senghenydd Welfare  Llanbradach Park  Ystrad Mynach Park

Description	Rev. Est. Savings '£,000 Reflecting part year	Impact narrative	Impact	Decision at Previous Scrutiny or New Proposal	APPENDIX 5 Further Detail on Savings Options
Parks and Playing Fields - Removal of Barrier Attendants at 5 locations		Car parks (at parks) will remain open. May result in increased littering and anti social behaviour after hours	Medium	New Proposal	The Barrier Sites affected would be:- • Rhymney Park • Nelson Park • Abertridwr Park • Morgan Jones Park
Residual Waste - Charging for all replacement containers	60	Provides clarity over existing policy. Generally low impact	Low	Not Supported - Request that Cabinet consider further	
Waste Strategy & Operations - Closure of 5 CA Sites for 2 days/week + 1 hour on other days	100	Obvious reduction in availability to public. Closure days would be staggered across 5 sites.	Medium	Original Option to fully close CA sites Not Supported - This is an alternative option to be considered	Implementation of staggered closure days would need to be planned carefully and could not be implemented quickly (signs would need to be ordered etc.). Consequently the full saving may not be realised in 2015/16.
Street Cleansing - Reduced Cleaning on bank holidays. Cleansing will be reduced to same levels as weekends	13	The only cleansing that will occur on bank holidays will be early mornings in town centres.	Medium	Supported	
Street Cleansing - Reduction on weed removal budget. Reduce contribution to winter rear lane grubbing out team	100	May result in increases in complaints from the public if weather conditions support weed growth.	Medium/ High	Supported	
Street Cleansing - Reduction in number of pedestrian sweepers operated (reduce by 1)		Rationalisation of the number of small sweepers will reduce the ability to cover the whole borough other than for specific periods.	Low	Supported	

Description	Rev. Est. Savings '£,000 Reflecting part year	Impact narrative	Impact	Decision at Previous Scrutiny or New Proposal	APPENDIX 5 Further Detail on Savings Options
Waste Strategy & Operations - Reduction in Cleansing Budget. Full Year impact £300k	100	• The Tull year proposed saving represents 7.4% of the total cleansing budget of £4.075m with the part year saving representing 2.45% • The process needs careful management involving Corporate HR at it will inevitably mean a reduction in number of jobs. There will be a significant impact in the cleanliness of the county borough • An increase in back office and contact centre workload could result from an increase in public complaints • Contact centre Service Level Agreement for nappy waste & missed collections will need to	High	INEW Pronosal	To achieve the targeted saving of 100k in 2015/16 and a further 200k in 2016/17 will require a downsizing of the street cleansing workforce by circa 15 staff (i.e.: by about 12%).  However, it is anticipated that this can be managed via early retirements/voluntary severance.
Cwmcarn Leisure Centre Centre closed - handover of facility to school	25	Consulting with key stakeholders. Negotiations ongoing with school regarding principle, but capital liability issues still to be resolved. This will be subject to a further report.	Low	Supported option to not reopen as a leisure Centre - This option is to handover facility to the school	
Sport & Leisure - Closure of Bedwas swimming pool on Sundays	10	Level of use can be accommodated at Caerphilly Leisure Centre.	Low	New Proposal	This process can be managed easily at Bedwas with no staffing issues or changes to permanent terms and conditions of employment. Bedwas has an average Sunday usage level of 25 Pool visitors.

Description	Rev. Est. Savings '£,000 Reflecting part year	Impact narrative	Impact	Decision at Previous Scrutiny or New Proposal	APPENDIX 5 Further Detail on Savings Options
Sport & Leisure - Average price increase of 5% on Leisure Centre Fees	100	Additional cost of 5% to users eg: Swim from £3.05 to £3.20 -Gym from £4.25 to £4.45	Low/Med ium	New Proposal	
TOTAL COMMUNITY & LEISURE S	1,018		£000		
		General - Savings that have no direct impact on service users	1,069		
TOTAL ENVIRONMENT	2,852	Individual Specific Savings	1,783		
		<b>Environment Direct</b>	2,852		